УДК 398
ББК Т52

***Улаан Борджиджиджин***
*профессор,*
*Институт этнологии и антропологии,*
*Китайская академия социологии*
*(Пекин, КНР), e-mail: ulaan0404@yahoo.com*

**Некоторые замечания по заверенной копии Гу «Тайная история монголов»**

Проверенная (достоверная) копия «Тайная история монголов», выполненная Гу, хранящаяся в редком книжном фонде Китайской национальной библиотеки, является лучшей рукописной копией «Тайной истории монголов» из всех сохранившихся и известных нам в настоящее время по своему происхождению – он снят с хорошей факсимильной копии с печатного издания, сделанного в начале династии Мин,, и по наименьшему числу ошибок, которые он содержит. Эта копия была завершена в 1805 г. и разделена на 12 глав. Позднее, в конце правления цинов, она перешла во владение Shengyu из императорского клана. В конце 19-го века Li Wentian и Вэнь Тинши отдельно подготовили факсимиле текста на основе копии из коллекции Shengyu. Вскоре после того Вэнь попросил кого-то снять копию со своей собственной для японского учёного Найто Конана. Е. Де-хуэй выполнил печатное издание с первой факсимильной копии Вэнь Цзябао и опубликовал его в 1908 г. Оно стало известно как издание Гуань Гу Тана. Именно с копии, предоставленной Найто Конану, Naka Michiyo смог выполнить свой знаменитый аннотированный перевод «Тайной истории монголов», озаглавленный как «The Veritable Records of Cinggis Qan». Вскоре после смерти Shengyu достоверная копия Гу была приобретена Шанхайским издательством Commercial Press. Данное издательство воспроизвело его фотографическим способом и опубликовало его в 1936 г. в 3-й серии Si-bu-cong-kan. Это издание содержит 41 лист печатного издания раннеминского периода, обнаруженного в Императорском дворце в Пекине в 1933 г., который заменил соответствующие листы оригинала в копии Гу. Таким образом, новая редакция считается лучшим современным изданием «Тайной истории монголов». Копия Гу была почти утеряна во время войны в 1930-х гг., но, к счастью, избежала уничтожения и в настоящее время хранится в безопасности в крупнейшей библиотеке Китая. Что касается отношений между копией Гу, листами печатного издания минского периода, обнаруженными в Пекинском дворце и изданием, опубликованным в 3-й серии Si-bu-cong-kan, то они ещё нуждаются в дополнительном уточнении и исследовании.

*Ключевые слова:* «Сокровенное сказание монголов», подтверждённая копия Гу, листы печатного издания минского периода, издание, опубликованное в 3-й серии Si-bu-cong-kan.

***Ulaan Borjigijin***
*Professor,*
*Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences.*
*(Beijin, China), e-mail:ulaan0404@yahoo.com*

**Some Remarks on Gu's Certified Copy of *The Secret History of the Mongols***

Gu's Certified Copy of *The Secret History of the Mongols* held in the rare book section of the Chinese National Library is the best manuscript copy of *The Secret History of the Mongols* among all those preserved and known to us so far, both for its origin from a good facsimile copy of the printed edition made in the early Ming and for the least number of mistakes it contains. This certified copy was completed in 1805 and was divided into 12 chapters. Later it came into the possession of the imperial clansman Shengyu of the late Qing. At the end of the 19th century Li Wentian and Wen Tingshi separately prepared a facsimile text on the basis of the copy in Shengyu's collection. Not long after, Wen asked someone to make a copy of his own copy for the Japanese scholar Naitō Konan. Ye De-hui made a printed edition from the first facsimile copy of Wen and published it in 1908. This is generally known as the Guan Gu Tang edition. It was from the copy available to Naitō Konan that Naka Michiyo was able to publish his famous annotated translation of *The Secret History of the Mongols* entitled "The Veritable Records of Činggis Qan". Not long after Shengyu's death, Gu's certified copy was acquired by the Commercial Press, Shanghai. The Commercial Press reproduced it pho-



© ***Борджиджиджин Улаан, 2013***

tographically and published it in 1936 in the 3rd series of the Si-bu-cong-kan. This edition contains 41 leaves of the printed edition of the early Ming discovered in the Imperial Palace of Beiging in 1933, which replaced the corresponding original leaves in Gu's certified copy. Hence, the new edition is regarded as the best modern edition of *The Secret History of the Mongols*. Gu's certified copy was nearly lost during the war in the 1930s, but fortunately escaped destruction and now lies safely in the collection of the leading library of China. As for the relationship between Gu's certified copy, the leaves of the Ming printed edition discovered in the Imperial Palace and the edition in the 3rd series of the Si-bu-cong-kan, there are still some questions that need to be clarified.

*Keywords*: *The Secret History of the Mongols*, the Gu's Certified Copy, the leaves of the Ming printed edition, the edition in the 3rd series of the Si-bu-cong-kan

The rare book section of the Chinese National Library has in its collection four manuscript copies of *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* (i. e. *The Secret History of the Mongols*) and one is Gu Guangqi's certified copy.

Gu's certified copy [1]is the most precious and best known manuscript, regarding which, however, some problems still need to be clarified. First of all, we should trace the history of its transmission. According to Gu Guangqi's colophon, in 1804 Gu he saw an "old facsimile copy of the original printed edition" in Prefect Zhang Xiangyun's collection; he then urged Zhang Guyu（i.e Zhang Dunren） to borrow and copy the book under his supervision (with his collation) the following year (1805). The new copy is usually called Gu's certified copy or Gu's collated copy. Gu's certified copy is one of the editions in 12 *juan* (chapters).[2] The original copy of Gu's certified copy would have been of good quality for it originated from the printed edition made at the beginning of the Ming dynasty. So Gu Guangqi introduced it as "complete and perfect throughout the whole work". Since both the Ming printed edition and "the old facsimile copy of the original printed edition" were not available, while the manuscript copies in 15 chapters are all originate from the text preserved in the *Yungle Encyclopedia* (*Yungle Dadian*) which was a copy of the Ming printed edition, Gu's certified copy became the best manuscript copy of *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* among all those preserved and known to us so far, and it received much attention from the scholarly world.

Gu's certified copy subsequently passed into other hand and was eventually acquired by Shengyu, a member of the Manchu imperial clan in the late Qing. Wen Tingshi and Li Wentian each prepared a facsimile copy based on the edition in the possession of Shengyu at the end of the 19th century.[3] Li Wentian completed his annotation of *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* and published his *Commentary on the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* in 1896.[4] Wen Tingshi had a duplicate made of his own copy for the Japanese scholar Naitō Konan (i. e. Naitō Torajirō).[5]Ye Dehui made a printed edition from the first facsimile copy of We Tingshi'[6]and published it in 1908.[7] His printed edition is generally known as

[1] The call number of its microcopy is 7394. At present the library provides readers only with the microcopy.

[2] Many of the copies which we know today are copies in 15 chapters. The copy in 15 chapters was recopied from the *Yongle Dadian* manucript text, while the latter was recopied from the printed edition of the early Ming. Out of the manuscript copies in 12 chapters only Gu's certified copy, the copy of the 2nd year of the Yongle period and the copy of the Qaračin prince's palace were handed down to our times. The copy of the 2nd year of the Yongle period, however, is a copy including only the sectional summarized translation, one of the extant (once belonging to Chen Yuan's Li-yun shu-wu Library) remains only the first six chapters. The copy of the Qaračin prince's palace (held in the ancient books section of Beijing University Library) is an incomplete copy, consisting only of about two chapters (Chapters 7–8).

[3] According to Wen Tingshi's note written on the cover of the copy which he presented to Naitō Konan, Wen Tingshi borrowed a copy from Shengyu in the winter of 1885, then he and Li Wentian each recopied it. William Hung supposed that the copy Wen Tingshi borrowed from Shengyu was not the original Gu's certified copy but a copy of it, because there are no seals with previous names nor Gu's name on the colophon. Cf. *The Transmission of the Book Known as The Secret History of the Mongols*, HJAS 14,1951, p.445f.

[4] Li Wentian, *Commentary on the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*, *Jian-xi cun-she Compilation*, 1896. Li's commentary was mainly on the edition of the *Lian-yun-yi Series* (with the sectional summaries only). The commentary was published one year after Li's death.

[5] The copy is held in the library of Institute of Human Studies, Kyōdo University, Japan. Some scholars claimed that it was the copy made by Wen Tingshi himself he presented to Naitō Konan. Actually it was not so. Wen Tingshi said in a letter to Naitō Konan (in *Collected Works of Wen Tingshi*, Zhonghua Book Company, 1993):"[I] have asked someone to make a copy *of The Secret History of the Yuan [Dynasty]* in Mongolian as transcribed in Chinese characters, and send it to you with respect." Wen Tingshi's letter to Naitō Konan accompanying the copy and his note written on the cover of the copy are both dated the eleventh day of the twelfth month of the year *xin-chou* ( i. e. the year of the whitish cattle), i. e. 10 January 1902.

[6] This copy was once held in Chen Yuan's Li-yun shu-wu Library, and subsequently came in the possession of his descendants. We are informed that the copy was auctioned at the end of 2009 in Beijing. However, the buyer is unknown.

[7] Yuan-chao mi-shi (*The Secret History of the Yuan*

the Guan-gu-tang edition or Ye Dehui's edition. When Naka Michiyo obtained a facsimile of the copy in the possession of Naitō Konan[1], he began to translate it and annotate it. He published his monumental work with the title *The Veritable Records of Cinggis Qan*[2]*(*an annotated translation of the The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*) in 1907. After Shengyu's death, his library was scattered and lost. Gu's certified copy was eventually acquired by the Han-fen-lou Library in Shanghai.[3]The Commercial Press reproduced it photographically and published it in 1936 in the 3rd series of the *Si-bu-cong-kan*. This edition contains 41 leaves of the early Ming printed edition discovered in the old storage building (the Ming *Nei-ge-da-ku*) in the Imperial Palace of Peking in 1933, which replaced the corresponding original leaves in Gu's certified copy. Hence the edition in the 3rd series of the *Si-bu-cong-kan,* i. e. the Commercial Press edition, is regarded as the best modern edition. Gu's certified copy was nearly lost during the war in the 1930s. According to Fu Zengxiang's memories, at that time Chen Yuan "was researching the history of the Yuan dynasty and hoped to get an old copy of *The Secret History [of the Yuan Dynasty]* for collation", so he wrote to Zhang Yuanji, the head of the Commercial Press, to borrow Gu's certified copy. When Fu Zengxiang received the copy he passed it to Chen Yuan. When Shanghai was bombed by the Japanese, the Han-fen-lou Library was badly damaged, but Gu's certified copy fortunately escaped disaster thanks to being lent out to Peking. Now it lies safely in the collection of the leading library of China.

As for the title of the book in Mongolian in Gu's certified copy, Gu Guangqi said in his colophon that there were eight characters reading *Mang-huo-lun niu-cha tuo-cha-an* following the [Chinese] title at the beginning of "the old facsimile copy of the original printed edition" in Zhang Xiangyun's collection, and that they "must be the name and title of the writer".[4] *Mang-huo-lun niu-cha tuo-cha-an* is the Chinese transliteration of the Mongolian words *Mongqol-un ni'uča tobča'an* which mean "The secret history of the Mongols". This is not a problem for scholars today, but it was not so easy for the Chinese scholars living at the beginning of the 19th century. Although Qian Daxin has suspected that *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* might be the *tuo-bu-chi-yan* (**tobčiyan*), i. e. the national history of the Yuan dynasty, in his book *Yuan-shi yi-wen zhi* (*Bibliography of Yuan Writings*) compiled in 1800, it was not until the beginning of the 20th century that Gu Guangqi's misinterpretation, which was adopted and followed by such Chinese scholars as Li Wentian and Ye Dehui, lost its popularity.[5] Just at that time circumstances changed.

In the preface of his work *The Veritable Records of Cinggis Qan* of 1907, Naka Michiyo correctly stated that *Mang-huo-lun niu-cha tuo-cha-an* was the transliteration of "The secret history of the Mongols" in Mongolian, and transcribed it as *Mongholun Niucha Tobchaan*. He further noted that the word *Mongholun* means "of the Mongols", *niucha* corresponds to *ni-gu-cha* in the *Yuan-shi yu-jie* (Explanation of Words in the *Yuan Shi*) means "secret", and *tobchaan* is the *tuo-bu-chi-yan* (**tobčiyan*) in the *Yuan-shi*, thus the three words mean "The secret veritable records of the Mongols", or "The secret history of the Mongols". Almost at the same time, the Chinese scholar Shen Cengzhi expressed a similar opinion in his *Supplement to* the *Commentary on the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*: "The word *ni-gu-cha* in Explanation of Words in the *Yuan Shi* means 'secret', in other words it is *niu-cha*." He also wrote: "In the Mongolian text of this book, *meng-gu* is always written as *mang-huo-lun*. The sound of *tuo-cha-an* is very close to that of *tuo-bi-chi-yan*. I suspect *mang-huo-lun* to mean 'Yuan', *niu-cha* 'secret', *tuo-cha-an* 'history', so the seven (eight, actually) characters are the [transliteration of] *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* in Mongolian".[6] Later, Wang Guowei expressed similar views on the subject in his *Colophon to the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty in Mongolian Language*, where we read:"There are the characters *mang-huo-lun niu-cha tuo-cha-an* in the two lines following

*Dynasty*), Guan-gu-tang Library of Ye's family of Changsha, 1908.

[1] This copy is held in Library of Tsukuba University, Japan. A copy of this copy is held in the Library of Waseda University, Japan.

[2] Naka Michiyo, *Chinggisu kan Jitsuroku* (*The Veritable Records of Cinggis Qan*), Tōkyō, 1907.

[3] Cf.Fu Zengxiang's *Colophon On the Manuscript Copy of The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*, *Tsang-yuan Qunshu Tiji* (*A Critical Bibliography of the Cangyuan Library), Shanghai Ancient Books Press, 1989.

[4] On *Mang-huo-lun niu-cha tuo-cha-an*, it was Gu Guangqi who first recorded that these eight characters were written at the beginning of "the old facsimile copy of the original printed edition" which he had seen in the collection of Zhang Xiangyun. The words were kept in Gu's certified copy. Among the manuscript copies which we could access today, only Pankratov's edition and Sun Xingyan's copy have the Mongolian title of *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* transcribed with Chinese characters, but the word *niu*(*-cha*) was miswritten as *zu*(*-cha*) in Pankratov's edition.

[5] Cf.Li Wentian's *Commentary on the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*, 1896, and Ye Dehui's preface of his printed edition, 1907.

[6] Cf. Shen Cengzhi's *Supplementry Commentary on the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*. His original text is held in the Shanghai Library. It was printed in the *Jing-ji-tang Series* in 1945.

the title at the beginning of the copy. When Gu Qianli (Gu Guangqi's style) wrote a colophon to this copy, he regarded them as the name of the writer. I think they are [the transliteration of] *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* in Mongolian. *Mang-huo-lun* means 'Mongol', and *tuo-cha-an* is the '*tuo-bu-chi-yan*' (**tobčiyan*) of the *Yuan Shi*".[1] According to the supplementary notes written by Zhang Ertian in the original manuscript of Shen Cengzhi, Shen Cengzhi had corrected Gu Guangqi's misinterpretation about twenty years earlier than Wang Guowei did. Wang Guowei's colophon was written in 1925[2],so Shen Cengzhi's *Supplement to Commentary on the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty* must have been completed around 1905. In his article *The Transmission of the Book Known as the Secret History of the Mongols* W. Hung wrote that Shen Cengzhi and Wang Guowei both came to a similar conclusion to that of Naka Michiyo, but "they were rather late". I am afraid his criticism sounds a little partial.

As to the relation between Gu's certified copy and the *Si-bu-cong-kan* edition, when the Commercial Press reproduced Gu's certified copy photographically, the original leaves in it had been replaced with the corresponding 41 leaves of the Ming printed edition discovered in the old storage building in the Peking Palace. However, we may find also some other changes in the details through careful comparison. I shall now examine the relation between the leaves of the Peking Palace, Gu's certified copy and the Commercial Press edition.

1.The 41 leaves of the Ming printed edition replaced in the Commercial Press edition are not all of the leaves discovered in the Peking Palace.

Zhao Wanli discovered more than 40 leaves of the Ming printed edition of *The History of the Yuan Dynasty* in the old storage building in the Imperial Palace of Peking in 1933. In his *Study of the Characters Used in the Transcription of the Sounds of the Yuan-chao mi-shi*, Chen Yuan states that "45 leaves" had been discovered at that time. On the other hand, Zhang Yuanji says in his colophon to the Commercial Press edition that he had borrowed "the leaves of the printed edition of the early Ming" and had taken photographs of them, and that he finally "obtained 41 leaves". W. Hung writes:" In 1933, in the old storage building known as *Nei-ko ta-k'u* in the Peking Palace, 41 leaves of the printed edition were discovered". Upon checking the microfilms of the original leaves, we can say that all the leaves discovered in the Peking Palace include 41 entire leaves i. e. with both recto and verso, and 4 half leaves. The Commercial Press edition replaced only the 41 entire leaves.[3] The reason why the 4 half leaves were not replaced is probably due to the technical difficulties.[4]

2. The Commercial Press edition made some changes to the contents of Gu's certified copy and even to the leaves discovered in the Peking Palace. For example:

| position | SBCK edition | Ming ed. leaves | Gu's certified copy |
|---|---|---|---|
| 031402 | gölö'ülüčin | görö'ülüčin | görö'ülüčin |
| 034610 | hoyar-i | qoyar-i | qoyar-i |
| 034802 | Toqula'un | Toqura'un | Toqura'un |
| 044505 | qajar-ača zhi hang | qajar-ača di hang | qajar-ača di hang |
| 044506 | dasi'an | daba'an | daba'an |
| 044909 | usun-i shui | usun-i shui hang | usun-i shui hang |
| 073208 | qara'u | qara'ul | qara'ul |
| 082309 | Siljuna | Baljuna | Baljuna |
| 084009 | turuq jiu su | turuq jiu yuan | turuq jiu yuan |

Unfortunately, all the above changes resulted in mistakes and somewhat affected the quality of the new edition.

3. Gu's certified copy is still useful for the textual collation of the work.

Gu's certified copy can be used to correct errors in the leaves of the Peking Palace and the Commercial Press edition. For example:

| position | SBCK edition (Ming ed. leaves) | Gu's certified copy |
|---|---|---|
| 044603 | yi | sha |
| 072910 | jian tong ri de hang | jian tong zi de hang |
| 082209 | lirliq | jarliq |
| 082708 | … | … |
| 083806 | … | … |

[1] Wang Guowei, *Colophon to the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty in the Mongolian Language*, *Guan-tang ji-lin*, vol.16, *Shi-lin* 8.

[2] Wang Guowei's *Colophon to the Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty in the Mongolian Language* was first written in one of Ye Dehui's edition which is held in the rare book section of the Chinese National Library. The colophon is dated the fifteenth day of the tenth month of the year *yi-chou* ( i. e. the year of the azure cattle), i. e. 30 November 1925.

[3] At present the original leaves are held in the National Central Library in Taipei. There is a microcopy of the leaves in the rare book section of the Chinese National Library in Beijing, under the call number CBM No.149 /96. The microcopy shows that all the leaves have been bound in one volume.

[4] The leaves replaced in the Commercial Press edition are: 9r-11v of chapter 3 ( § 106—108), 13r-16v of chapter 3 ( § § 108–110), 46r-48v of chapter 3 ( § § 124–125); 45r-49v of chapter 4 ( § § 146–147); 29r-36v of chapter 7( § § 194–195); 21r-29v of chapter 8 ( § § 201–203), 32r-40v of chapter 8 ( § § 203—207). The 4 half leaves which were not replaced are 8v of chapter 3 ( § 106), 12v of chapter 3 ( § 108); 20v of chapter 8 ( § 201), 31v of chapter 8 ( § 203).

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 082410 | ügülesü ke'en | ügülesü ke'en |
| | shuo me dao | shuo me dao |
| 083809 | yi er han shan | bu er han shan |

Gu's certified copy can also be used to complete the damaged parts of the leaves of the Peking Palace. Some of the leaves were damaged in varying degrees, but the missing parts were restored in the Commercial Press edition. The damaged characters must have been replaced on the basis of those in Gu's certified copy. For example:

| position | SBCK edition (Ming ed.leaves) | Gu's certified copy |
|---|---|---|
| 031602 | [] | söni |
| 031606 | []yu<br>ming | xiang yu<br>zhong ming |
| 031608 | []<br>[] | r<br>mu |
| 031610 | [] | you yue ming. dou xiang |
| 034605 | [] | -lasuqai |
| 034606 | qu[]<br>[] | qurban-i<br>san ge hang |
| 044802 | qa[]r-iyan | qahan-dur-iyan |
| 083601 | quan le | quan zi<br>(the horizontal stroke of le was damaged) |

4. It was indeed necessary that the Ming edition leaves should replace those in Gu's certified copy in the Commercial Press edition.

To restore the missing words of Gu's certified copy. For example:

| position | SBCK edition(Ming ed.leaves) | Gu's certified copy |
|---|---|---|
| 030905 | qaldun shan | qadun shan |
| 031002 | Tümed | Tüme |
| 031005 | xiao he hang | he hang |
| 031107 | gödöljü | gödöjü |
| 031110 | üje'ed | üje'e |
| 031502 | čeri'üd | čeri'ü |
| 031603 | olba<br>xia zan | oba<br>zan |
| 034705 | quriyaldusu | quriyadusu |
| 044504 | mang zou le de | zou le de |
| 044803 | shuo le a | shuo le |
| 073605 | gübčin beye | güčin beye |
| 082102 | tai zu huang di | huang di |
| 082604 | Tobsaqa | Tosaqa |
| 083405 | soyurqal | soyurqa |
| 084009 | nöbšildüjü | nöšildüjü |

Errors in Gu's certified copy were thus also avoided. For example:

| position | SBCK edition (Ming ed.leaves) | Gu's certified copy |
|---|---|---|
| 031501 | huru'u | hulu'u |
| 034705 | ügülerün quluqana | ügülelün quluhana |
| 034710 | Bo'orču Öngür | Bo'orču (r was represerved by the character *er* without a little *she* on its left shoulder) Öngür |
| 034803 | Toqura'un | Toqula'un |
| 044501 | čeri'üd | čeli'üd |
| 044503 | qajar-ača | qasengr-ača |
| 044505 | qonoqsan dürbekün | honoqsan dürbekün |
| 044802 | ya'aran | ya'alan |
| 073505 | ere-yi | ele-yi |
| 073510 | doromji- ača | dorolji- ača |
| 082104 | qor | hor |
| 082304 | ni you jun jie | ni ren jun jie |
| 082909 | aldatuqai | aldatuhai |
| 083304 | töreldügsen | šöreldügsen |
| 083606 | külüg-iyer | külüše-yer |

5. There are some mistakes in the 4 half leaves which were not replaced in the Commercial Press edition such as vertical lines for proper names omitted in three places.

| position | Gu's certified copy | SBCK edition (Ming ed.leaves) |
|---|---|---|
| 030808 | To'oril qan<br>huang di | To'oril qan<br>huang di |
| 030809 | Temüjin<br>ren ming | Temüjin<br>ren ming |
| 083107 | Šigiqutuqu<br>ren ming | Šigiqutuqu<br>ren ming |

In addition, the word *qian* (*front) in vol.3,p.8,l.8 of the leaves was incorrectly written as *jian* (*arrow) in Gu's certified copy, and the mistake was retained in the Commercial Press edition.

When making the textual collation of *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*, which is a necessary step for the investigation of the work, I think we should take the Commercial Press edition——universally accepted as the best edition available today ——as the basic copy and check it against the other manuscript copies either in 12 chapters or in 15 chapters (including of course the leaves discovered in the Peking Palace and now held in the National Central Library in Taipei). Among the all manuscript copies of *The Secret History of the Yuan Dynasty*, Gu's certified copy is still worth collating for reference because the Commercial Press edition introduced some changes to it.

Статья поступила в редакцию 10 апреля 2013 г.